

Kazakh national University of arts

UDC 782.9

ABSTRACT

of the dissertation of S. K. Musakhodzhayeva
"Collective authorship in the Kazakh Opera"
submitted for the degree of doctor of philosophy (PhD)
specialty 6D040100 – Musicology

Republic of Kazakhstan

Nur-Sultan, 2020

The dissertation was performed at the Department of "musicology and composition" of the Kazakh National University of arts

Scientific consultants:

Dzhumakova U. R. – doctor of arts,
Professor of the Kazakh national University of arts
"Musicology and composition" Department

Bulycheva A.V. – candidate of art history,
associate Professor of the Moscow state Conservatory named after P.I.Tchaikovsky
"History of foreign music" Department

Official reviewers:

Ulmasov F. A. – doctor of arts,
Professor of the Tajik state Institute of culture and arts named after M. Tursunzade
"History and theory of music" Department

Abdrakhman G. B. – candidate of art history,
Professor of the Kazakh national Conservatory named after Kurmangazy
"Musicology and composition" Department

Defense will be held on November 25, 2020 at 16.00 at the meeting of Dissertation Council of "Kazakh national University of arts" at 50 Taulsizdik str., Nur-Sultan in online mode on the ZOOM platform, the link to connect will be added to the website kaznui.kz 18.10.2020

The dissertation can be found in the library of the Kazakh national University of arts and on the <https://kaznui.kz/musakhodzhaeva-saule-karasaevna/>
The abstract was sent out on 25.10.2020

Interest in forms of collective creativity and authorship is noted in various spheres of human activity. Co-authorship is a common practice in many types of art: painting, sculpture, literature, and cinema. No less often, collective creativity and authorship are found in the musical art, where it is possible to combine several authors in different genres (instrumental Suite, film music, oratorio, hymn). The most favorable conditions for collaboration of authors arise in musical and stage genres (Opera, vaudeville, musical, etc.). **The object** of our research is Opera.

As a synthetic genre, Opera includes several types of arts and involves the collective creativity of the composer, librettist, Director, conductor, performers, etc. In addition, an Opera can be created by several composers. Collectively written operas have emerged in various periods of history and in various national cultures. Collective authorship is also in the Kazakh Opera.

The history of the Kazakh Opera art spans the twentieth century and the beginning of the twenty first century. Eight operas officially recognized as collectively written: A.Zhubanov and L. Hamidi "Abai" (1944), E. Brusilovsky and M. Tulebayev "Amangeldy" (1945), A. Zhubanov and L. Hamidi "Tulegen Tokhtarov" (1949), V.Velikanov and L. Hamidi "Bes dos" (1948), N. Tlendiev and K. Kuzhamyarov "Altyn Taular" (1961), Y. Rakhmadiev, G. Grisbil, A. Bychkov "Prairie glow" (1967), A. Zhubanov, G. Zhubanova "Kurmangazy (1987), A. A. Zhaim and Zhaimov "Sultan Baybars" (2007). In addition, the properties of collective authorship are manifested in the creation and subsequent productions of other Kazakh operas. Therefore, the main object of research in this dissertation — Kazakh Opera in its full historical cross — section (1934-2020)-includes works not only officially designated as collective, but also individually written (E. Brusilovsky "Kyz-Zhibek", M.Tulebaev "Birzhan and Sara").

The urgency of the problem of collective authorship lies in the need to resolve the contradiction between musical practice, which presents many examples of operas created in collaboration, and the existing insignificant knowledge about them, the lack of understanding of the role of co-creation of composers in the development of Opera, in its past and present. The significance of various forms of Association in contemporary creative activity forces us to rethink co-authorship in the operatic heritage, which was sometimes treated with condescension and even prejudice.

The purpose of this study is to use the experience of the Kazakh Opera to establish historical and cultural patterns of collective authorship, its origin, characteristic properties and historical forms. Modern musical culture, which confirms that the co-creation of composers is one of the objective properties of Opera art, makes it necessary for musicology to understand the phenomena of collective authorship not only in the axiological aspect, but also as a subject of ontology and epistemology. The artistic motivations of the Association of composers are connected with the uniqueness of musical creativity, with the development of the Opera genre in the context of musical culture and in a certain historical period, as well as with the life of the Operas in subsequent productions and editions.

Degree of study. As an independent scientific problem, the phenomenon of collective authorship has not yet received special musicological development. As a rule, they study works written alone. The practice of collective creativity of composers has not found a definite meaning in theory, and the ideas about this phenomenon do not correspond to the historical and cultural role that it played in the history of music.

To study collective authorship in the Kazakh Opera, literature was studied in several areas related to this topic. In modern musicology, the topic of collective authorship as a special problem is devoted to a few works. The first group of studies included works on the history of Opera. Studies show the diversity of the collective operas and the attitude of the early period of the development of musical theatre. It is interesting that special historical studies (R. Rolland, G. Kretschmar) on Western European music contain almost no mention of collective operas. They are focused on the study of Opera seria, while collective collaboration distinguished the work of composers in the genre of comic Opera and was widespread in France and Russia. Information about the practice of co-authorship is contained in the review articles of The encyclopedia "The New Grove Dictionary of Opera", dedicated to individual composers who composed in collective authorship (A. Burton, F. Buoldier, R. Kreutzer, F. Paer, L. Cherubini). Historical research shows that the first collective operas belong to the period of formation of the genre in European culture and were created by Italian composers Jacopo Peri, Giuseppe Caccini and Ottavio Rinuccini ("Daphne", "the Marriage of Medoro and Angelica" (1597).

The study of Kazakh operas presents a wide range of issues related to its connection with the traditional musical heritage and the refraction of its features in musical material and composition. In the study of creativity of individual composers, as a rule, they pay much attention to questions of genre, dramaturgic, compositional features of their operas, describes the history of creation and productions. (S. Kuzembaeva, N. Ketegenova, T. Djumalieva, D. Beisalieva, G. Abulgazina, A. Omarova, etc.).

The study and analysis of Kazakh musicological literature shows that the issues of collective authorship have not received special development, although there have been similar works in the history of Kazakh Opera, and one of them — the Opera "Abai" by A. Zhubanov and L. Khamidi, studied in many works, is one of the outstanding achievements of Opera art in Kazakhstan. The subjective reasons for this are inherent in the complexity of the subject itself. Musicologists do not raise questions related to the reputation of a creative person, his recognition, fate and memory. The objective reason, in our opinion, lies in the fact that authorship is included in the range of issues of composing creativity, while for a long time the problem of national roots of modern music has been recognized as relevant in Kazakh musicology.

To present a General picture of co-authorship in related national musical cultures, we studied works devoted to the Opera work of composers from Central

Asia and Russia. The prevalence of co-authorship is evidenced by the work of the founders of the Opera genre (S. Vasilenko, M. Ashrafi "Buran", R. Glier, T. Sadykov "Leyli and Majnun", D. Hajiyev, K. Karaev "vyatyan", V. Vlasov, A. Maldybaev and V. fere "Ajal orduna", A. Shaposhnikov, Yu.Meitus, D. Ovezov "Leyli and Majnun", A. Znosko-Borovsky, V. Mukhatov "Akpamyk" etc.). The practice of co-creation in the Opera art of the Union republics was criticized in the magazine "Soviet music", on the pages of which the problems of national Opera were actively discussed in the 1940s and 1950s.

Scientific literature was used to study the topic, which indirectly leads to an in-depth understanding of the problem of collective authorship posed in the dissertation. This study is devoted to productions of operas. The musical performance as an object of research has attracted the attention of scientists in the last two decades. Due to the variety of conductor's interpretations, they revealed the variability and changeability of the Opera text, which is not always a predictable result of collective creativity, which affects the "problems of authorship" of the performance. A number of articles devoted to the classification of an Opera performance include the following parameters: the presence, nature and degree of changes in the score and libretto (editorial Board), which also relates to the manifestations of collective creativity and authorship (E. Tsodokov, O. Makarova, E. Krivonogova).

Research methodology. The initial methodological basis is three ways of cognition of collective authorship. First, it is considered in close connection with collective creativity. Second, it is an indivisible whole. That is why the task of the research is not to find out the specific share of participation of authors and the types and volume of work performed by each author, but to search for signs of collective authorship that determined the properties of musical and stage works and the peculiarities of the development of Opera art in Kazakhstan. Third, it is studied in a variety of ways that are not limited to operas with an officially designated group of composers.

To achieve this goal, the following research principles and methods are used in the dissertation. The **historical principle** is that Kazakh operas written by a team of authors are considered in a specific time. This allows us to see the phenomenon of collective authorship as General, and at the same time specific to a certain period. The article reveals the evolution of attitudes to collective Opera composition. The early stage of Kazakh Opera (1930–1950), the period of active development (1960–1980) and the time that covers the development of Kazakhstan's society in the conditions of independence (1990–2020), which gave a new impetus to Opera art and the entire musical culture, are highlighted.

The **genre approach** consists in the fact that the phenomena of collective creativity and authorship are considered as generally significant, peculiar not only to Kazakh music. Based on the system of musical genres and genre conditionality of works, the space for the distribution of collective creativity in music is established

and musical genres that are based on the possibility of collective authorship are determined. Genre prerequisites created the ground for collective creativity and authorship in the Kazakh Opera.

The **cultural approach** is that Kazakh operas are considered in close connection with the solution of cultural needs at a certain stage. External reasons for collective music composition form the types of relationships between authors, between the author and the editor. To determine the properties of collective authorship, we compare the musical texts that belong to the author and were created by the editor in the process of preparing productions that characterize the life of Opera in a changing culture. Based on the comparison, the editors' critical attitude to the original source and the author's approach is established. In order to determine changes in the source text, a textual analysis of the revisions is performed.

The application of the **biographical method** is due to the peculiarities of the history of Opera creation and the creative development of composers, which led to the collective composition of music. Not only historical and cultural conditions, but also internal spiritual, ethical, and psychological motives of creativity generate co-authorship in various forms of its manifestation.

Collective authorship is a common feature of musical creativity, regardless of its time and space. Therefore, the dissertation uses a **comparative research method**. The experience of Kazakh Opera correlates with the General processes of Opera art.

The research materials were the full scores and piano scores in published and manuscript versions, as well as audio and video recordings of the operas of E. Brusilovsky "Kyz Zhibek" (1934), A. Zhubanov and L. Hamidi "Abai" (1944), M. Tulebaev "Birzhan and Sara" (1946), A. Zhubanov, G. Zhubanova "Kurmangazy" (1986).

Theoretical provisions of dissertation:

Collective authorship is one of the properties of composers' creativity. In contrast to collective creativity, which determines the cooperation of different specialists in musical and theatrical art in Opera culture, collective authorship concerns not only the aggregate right in the public presentation of an artistic product. It characterizes the collaboration of composers in creating a work of art in the form of a musical text. The Association of composers for creating operas is represented in different national musical cultures and in different periods of historical development.

1. The joint work of composers predispose certain genre terms. Opera, along with other musical and stage genres, has in its structure specific signs of dissection and isolation, which allow several composers to participate in the composition of a musical text.

2. Co-Authorship of composers in the creation of the Opera is manifested in two forms. Real collective authorship refers to operas created in collaboration with several composers. It is enshrined in copyright and is officially designated in the musical text. The hidden form of collective authorship is found in those works that

officially have an individual author, but under the influence of certain factors have signs of a musical text that indicate the participation of another author (or several).

3. Collective authorship in the Kazakh Opera has played a significant role in the development of Opera culture in Kazakhstan. In the 1930s and 1960s, most examples of collective operas were created. They present different forms of collective authorship, which are also characteristic of the global Opera practice.

4. The history of the Kazakh Opera reflects the objective factors of collective authorship, which determined the regularity of its occurrence in the musical and stage field, in particular, in Opera practice. Five main factors determine the co-creation of composers in the Opera genre.

5. The Association of composers in the creation of an Opera is greatly influenced by the time factor. It is found in the predominance of collective authorship in the early period of the Opera's formation. Often composers used the temporary advantages of co-authorship due to the limited time allotted by the customer (theater management, producer, etc.) to compose music.

6. At the stage of professional development of a composer, the relationship between a teacher and a student creates a situation of co-creation. The professional factor of collective authorship is manifested when a teacher participates in the creation of an author's musical text belonging to a student who is learning the experience of composing works in major genres. The resulting hidden form of co-authorship is based on the recognition of the professional authority of the teacher, whose participation affects the successful creation of an opera.

7. The biographical factor of collective authorship applies when A musical and stage work of one author remains unfinished as a result of the composer's sudden death, and its completion is performed by another person. Co-authors include not only composers, but also conductors, editors, and textologists. An incomplete work in the process of its integral textual embodiment acquires the property of hidden collective authorship.

8. The spiritual and moral Factor of uniting composers shows the co-authorship of like-minded composers. A work born in the spiritual and moral unity of composers has such qualities of unity and integrity that do not allow us to consider the contribution of each composer separately.

9. Properties of collective authorship in the Opera can arise after a work's creation, when staging the Opera. The cultural factor of co-authorship of composers is that the future fate of the Opera after its creation depends on the productions, and its implementation includes conductors, producers, and Directors who can make changes not only to the stage, but also to the musical text of the Opera. They become hidden co-authors of a musical and stage work.

10. Operas created in collective authorship form a small, exclusive part of the Opera heritage. The very fact of collective authorship is not the basis for their axiological interpretation. Like operas that officially have an individual music author, they meet the General requirements of artistic value.

Scientific result. The dissertation confirms that the co-creation of composers is one of the objective properties of Opera art. In the history of Kazakh Opera, the role of operas created in the collective co-authorship of composers is established. The uniqueness of creativity in the creation of outstanding examples of national Opera — "Kyz-Zhibek" by E. Brusilovsky, "Abay" by A. Zhubanov and L. Khamidi, "Birzhan and Sara" by M. Tulebayev, "Kurmangazy" by A. and G. Zhubanov is revealed. The dissertation shows the life of Opera works in subsequent productions and edits associated with collective creativity in the musical and stage arts. On the example of the Kazakh Opera, genre prerequisites and forms of collective authorship are determined, and the main factors that determined the regularity of co-authorship of composers are revealed.

The theoretical significance of the work is that the experience of studying national Opera art is enriched by such theoretical positions as understanding collective authorship as one of the properties of Opera art, establishing five factors of its natural manifestation, and determining the types of co-authorship (real and hidden). These provisions show the important role of collective creativity and authorship in the history of Kazakh Opera.

The practical value of the work lies in the fact that in the initial approach to the study of co-authorship of composers, it is proposed to abandon the axiological aspect generally accepted in scientific practice and consider collective works in the Opera genre in the context of General problems of Opera art. The difference between collective creativity and authorship is important for further scientific understanding and evaluation of modern Opera art in the aspect of productions in which the activities of Directors, conductors, producers, etc. play a significant role.

For educational practice, the study of collective authorship in Kazakh Opera is important because it reveals more fully the history of the formation, development and flourishing of musical and stage genres in Kazakhstan. Features of the creative biography of composers and the process of working on the creation of works in collaboration can be additional methodological material for the development of musical and historical disciplines. General historical periodization of collective operas, information on the operas "Kyz-Zhibek", "Birzhan and Sara", "Abay", "Kurmangazy" can be used in the study of the history of music in Kazakhstan and the history of world music.

Approbation of the dissertation. The dissertation was prepared at the Department of Musicology and composition of the Kazakh national University of arts. Discussed and recommended for defense at the extended meeting of the Department on June 25, 2020.

Provisions of the thesis presented by the author in presentations at three international conferences, reflected in three scientific articles in journals recommended by CCSES of Ministry of Education of RK, in an article in the magazine included in the Scopus database.

**List of publications on the topic of the dissertation:
a) in the publications recommended by Control Committee of the
Education and Science Sphere of Ministry of Education of RK:**

1. Musakhodzhayeva S. Opera "Kyz-Zhibek" by Evgeny Brusilovsky evolution of the musical text in the history of productions // Bulletin of al-Farabi Kazakh national University, Cultural studies and political Science series. No. 1 (67). – Almaty, 2019. – P. 30–42.

2. Musakhodzhayeva S. The national anthem of the Kazakh SSR: the history of collective creativity and authorship // Bulletin OF the ENU named after L. N. Gumilyov. №3 (124). – Astana, 2018. – P. 70–81.

3. Musakhodzhayeva S. Opera "Abai" by A. Zhubanov and L. Khamidi: spiritual and ethical basis of co-authorship of composers // Science and life of Kazakhstan. No. 5/1. – Nur-Sultan, 2020. – P. 361–367.

b) in the Scopus database:

4. Dzhumakova U., Musakhodzhayeva S. Collective creativity and authorship in Opera: historical experience of musical culture of Kazakhstan// Problems of music science. No. 1. – Ufa, 2019. – P. 99–106.

c) at international scientific conferences:

5. Musakhodzhayeva S. Collective authorship in the Kazakh Opera. To the problem statement// Musical traditions in a globalizing world. Materials of the First international scientific and practical conference. – Baku, 2017. – P. 45–48.

6. Musakhodzhayeva S. the role of traditional musicians in the creation of E. Brusilovsky's Opera "Kyz-Zhibek" //Traditional music: problems of history and theory. Materials of the international scientific and practical conference in the framework of the festival of traditional music dedicated to the 200th anniversary of Kurmangazy Sagyrbayev. – Almaty, 2018. – P. 252–255.

7. Musakhodzhayeva S. Kazakh Opera classics in the productions of the Astana Opera theater //Materials of the first international scientific conference "Opera in musical theater: History and Modernity". – Moscow, 2019. – P. 354–367.

Structure of the work: the dissertation consists of an Introduction, 6 sections, Conclusion, list of literature sources, audio and video recordings of 220 titles, 2 appendices (database of works created in collective authorship from 1597 to 2020, title pages of works written in collective authorship).

The Introduction reveals the relevance of the topic of the dissertation, defines the purpose and objectives, the object and subject of research, and methodological the basis, degree of study, scientific novelty, justified the provisions

submitted for defense, theoretical and practical significance, data on the approbation and structure of the work.

The first section "Collective creativity and authorship as General concepts of music" specifies the content of such terms as "author", "authorship", "collective creativity", "collective authorship", "real and hidden authorship". The concepts of collective creativity and collective authorship are differentiated. The author considers the forms of authorship in folklore and professional art. It is shown that the ontological nature of musical art implies the manifestation of collective creativity in the system "author–composer–performer". The definition of editorial work as a hidden form of authorship expands the idea of the forms of collective authorship in the musical art.

The second section "Genre prerequisites of collective authorship in Kazakh Opera" defines the possibilities of collective authorship in different musical genres. In the field of instrumental music, cadences of solo concerts are considered, in which performers manifest themselves as authors. In the field of vocal music, the hymn genre has a collective authorship. The history of collective creation of the anthem of the Kazakh SSR is described. It is shown that the collective authorship of the hymn was due to such genre features as the objective tone of the epic utterance, narrative, and intonation generality. The structural features of theatrical and stage genres also have a collective authorship. In musical and stage genres, the main features of the structure and type of content are determined, which caused the greatest spread of collective authorship in this group of genres (Opera, operetta, musical, etc.).

In the history of national Opera schools, collective authorship was most common during the formative period. In the Association of composers for creating operas, the time factor is defined as the primary, main one. The authors resorted to collaboration when they were limited in time, most often for the urgent creation of operas for various events. At the stage of formation of the Kazakh Opera art, the social state order for the creation of Opera works was of great importance, which motivated professionally "immature" national composers to unite in creative unions with more professional composers. During the formation of national Opera schools, more than thirty collective Opera works were created by state order.

The third section "Traditions of the professional composer school of Kazakhstan and features of creativity at the stage of its formation" examines the role of teacher-student relationships in different composer schools when creating works. The article reveals the features of professional development of M. Tulebayev and the participation of his teacher — the founder of the composer school of Kazakhstan E. Brusilovsky in this process. Based on his "Diaries" shows the history of creative collaboration between E. Brusilovsky and M. Tulebaev, as well as the role of E. Brusilovsky in the creation of the Opera "Birzhan and Sarah". It is hypothesized that in the creation of the Opera "Birzhan and Sarah" E. Brusilovsky acts as a hidden co-author. To substantiate the degree of influence of E. Brusilovsky on M. Tulebaev, the author considers the traditions of teaching composing skills in the Russian school

of composition. We believe that for a long time in kazakh musicology there was a tendency to mythologize history and to embellish facts in connection with the ideological course that required the rapid development of professional musical culture. In our opinion, as a teacher, E. Brusilovsky not only edited the musical material of the Opera, but also participated in its creation.

The fourth section "creative Union of A. Zhubanov and L. Khamidi in the creation of the Opera "Abai" is devoted to the study of external and internal reasons for the Association of composers to create the Opera "Abai". The author reveals similar ways of professional development of A. Zhubanov and L. Khamidi, common areas of their multi-faceted activities, the same genre areas of composer's creativity and the unity of views on the role of Abai in national culture. The successful fate of the Opera "Abai" sets the value of the spiritual and ethical unity of the composers, which is manifested in the intonation content of the Opera and in the interpretation of the image of Abai. Based on the involvement of original documents, statements of authors, eyewitnesses and contemporaries, light is shed on complex issues of collective authorship in the creation of this Opera. The melodic material of the Opera is analyzed and the circle of intonation connections of Abai's part with the Lado-rhythmic turns characteristic of Abai's songs is revealed. The analysis of the Opera's musical material showed that in this work the spiritual and moral closeness of the composers led to the musical and stylistic unity of the Opera, which allowed us to perceive collective authorship in the artistic meaning of this phenomenon.

The fifth section "Kurmangazy" by A. and G. Zhubanov: from individual design to collective authorship" covers the issues of authorship of the Kurmangazy Opera, in connection with the publication of the clavier and score in 2009. In the latest edition of the Opera's score and clavier, discrepancies were found with the original sources: manuscripts and scientific articles about this work. The history of the Opera's creation and the participation of two authors A. and G. Zhubanov In its implementation are considered. The authorship of A. Zhubanov in relation to the idea, material, plot of the work and G. Zhubanova in relation to the musical text, composition and drama is shown. The established discrepancy between the title page of the clavier and the score and the manuscript indicates unresolved problems of a scientific nature related to textual research. In the creative biography of A. Zhubanov, the main reasons for the birth of an individual idea dedicated to the image of Kurmangazy are determined. The area of his author's participation is shown in the formation of the musical material of the Opera and libretto. The author substantiates the inclusion of G. Zhubanova in the completion of the idea, defines the stages of implementation of the musical text of the Opera as a collective work (radio Opera, Opera).

The sixth section "Kyz-Zhibek" by E. Brusilovsky: collective creativity and authorship in the history of productions" highlights the main musical editions of the Opera and the ratio of author's and non-author's material in them. The first sample of the national Opera is considered as a unique example of the composer's

collaboration with performers of Kazakh folk songs who participated in its production and premiere. Changes to the Opera's musical text are determined based on information about the author's edits. In subsequent productions, the need for musical revisions was determined by the reworking of a musical and dramatic performance into an Opera. In the production of "Kyz-Zhibek" by the Astana Opera theater (2017), a significant change in the author's text is associated with the introduction of new musical material by the editor A. Mukhitdinov. This edition can be considered as a hidden form of collective authorship. A comparison of the scores showed that the greatest changes in the musical text of the work were made in the 2017 edition. It significantly changes the basic aspects of the original — pitch, rhythmic, textured expressive means, as well as the composition of numbers and sections. The introduction to scientific use of knowledge about Opera productions and editions expands the idea of the life of the first national Opera "Kyz Zhibek" in the musical culture of Kazakhstan.

The Conclusion contains the main conclusions of the study. The study showed that collective authorship is a large — scale topic. It does not focus on internal issues of musical culture development. First, it closely links Kazakh Opera with the General development of Opera art. Using various examples from the experience of foreign and Russian Opera, the paper shows the connection between the co-creation of composers in the Opera genre and such phenomena as the origin of Opera, the creative process of creation, and stage production.

Secondly, the complexity and diversity of possible solutions to the problem is also explained by interdisciplinary connections. The study of Opera as a genre of musical art involves understanding its features as a synthetic art form and its special socio-cultural purpose among all academic genres of the Opera and Symphony tradition. In contrast to previous works on Kazakh Opera, the problem of collective authorship has brought the study of Opera as a live production to a new level.

Third, it was impossible to solve these problems within the framework of previous methodological traditions. In order to understand the regularities of composers' co-creation, it was necessary to approach Opera as a musical text that not only "unfolds" every time the work is listened to and presented, but also "fits" into the stage text. In this way of interaction between music and theater, the original author's text of the composer is subjected to various interpretations. In the dissertation, a comparison of musical editions is made and the influence of statement tasks on changes in the author's text is studied.

The study of the Kazakh Opera in the aspect of regularities of collective creativity and authorship in this thesis was conducted in the context of the General history and theory of Opera and, more broadly, considering the role of co-authorship in other forms of art. The experience of cooperation between composers in the creation of Kazakh operas and the Director-production creative group confirms the scientific conclusions of scientists in other fields of art about the historical and cultural significance of collective authorship.